Abdominal wall hernia caused by accident?
A guide to ACC cover

Conference for General Practice
29 July 2017

Julian Speight, New Zealand Association of General Surgeons
Peter Jansen, Accident Compensation Corporation
Prof Sir David Spiegelhalter

Winton Professor of Public Understanding of Risk, Cambridge University
Prof Sir David Spiegelhalter

Winton Professor of Public Understanding of Risk, Cambridge University
Presentation outline

1. Why did we need a guide to hernia cover?
2. How did we develop the guide?
3. When can ACC cover hernias?
4. Case studies - examples
Why did we need a guide to hernia cover?

Criteria for inguinal hernia cover developed in 2001 in response to the study by Smith et al

Why did we need a guide to hernia cover?

• Received wisdom (?common sense) that strenuous lifting causes an inguinal hernia
Why did we need a guide to hernia cover?

• Received wisdom (?common sense) that strenuous lifting causes an inguinal hernia

The evidence is contrary to that view

• Smith et al provided some evidence for what claims might be an injury caused by accident.
Why did we need a guide to hernia cover?

Problems with the Smith criteria:

• Inconsistent use e.g. applied to non-inguinal hernia

• Illogical explanations e.g.
  • patient is stoic so was able to continue working
  • no pain means a small tear has grown over time
  • usual activities but this time it caused a rupture
Why did we need a guide to hernia cover?

There was a need for clarity so we could be:
• Fairer on patients: realistic expectations
• Fairer on GPs: greater consistency and transparency
• Fairer on surgeons: more appropriate referrals
• Consistent with modern scientific understanding of hernias.
Updated guide to hernia cover

All abdominal wall hernias not just inguinal

- agreement on when ACC covers hernia as a personal injury caused by an accident
- more certainty to GPs and DHBs on what claims should be submitted to ACC.
Updated guide to hernia cover

Developing similar guidelines for other types of hernia ie incisional hernias

Incisional hernias are not part of this guide because these are considered under a different part of the Accident Compensation Act. A guide is under development.
ACC cover for abdominal wall hernias

ACC can cover hernias that have been caused by:

- an accident (primary abdominal wall hernias)
- work-related gradual process
- treatment injury (some incisional hernias).

The new Guide to ACC cover relates only to hernias caused by an accident.
How did we develop the guide?

- Expert Advisory Group included practicing surgeons nominated by NZ Board of RACS and senior ACC medical advisors
- An evidence-based researcher carried out a systematic search of medical databases
- Review of scientific literature published between 2001 and 2016
- Multiple Expert Advisory Group meetings in 2016 to agree what factors should be considered in deciding whether a hernia is caused by an accident
- The guide is based on current scientific knowledge and cumulative clinical experience and expert opinion.
**Primary abdominal wall hernias, including groin hernias**

*An A guide to ACC cover*

**March 2017**

**Purpose**
This document provides guidance on when ACC is likely to cover as abdominal wall hernia as an injury caused by an accident. The recommendations in this guide reflect the consensus views of the Expert Advisory Group representing ACC and the Royal Australian College of Surgeons.

**Key points:**
- The prevalence of abdominal wall hernias in the general population is difficult to estimate because a hernia is often asymptomatic.
- The aetiology and pathogenesis of abdominal wall hernias are multifactorial and complex.
- In many instances, a hinge point exists through which an existing abdominal wall defect may enlarge if not associated with other hernias.
- Ultrasound is not indicated when a hernia is clinically obvious.
- ACC does not cover hernias that are caused wholly or substantially by disease or ageing.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of hernia</th>
<th>Common statement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traumatic abdominal wall hernia</td>
<td>Hernias are a result of a direct blow to the abdominal wall involving extreme force and a traumatic rupture are rare in clinical practice. Typically, these hernias are associated with an abdominal wall defect or complicated by a laceration or abrasion of the hernia. ACC is likely to cover these injuries if contemporaneous hospital or medical records confirm tissue disruption and a fascial defect in the wound.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Femoral hernia</td>
<td>Common statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epigastric hernia</td>
<td>Common statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Umbilical or pure inguinal hernia</td>
<td>Common statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spigelian hernia</td>
<td>Common statement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Guide development**

- The guide was developed by the Expert Advisory Group representing ACC and the Royal Australian College of Surgeons (RACS).

**Acknowledgements**

- ACC wishes to thank the RACS representatives for their assistance in providing this guide.

- Approved by the New Zealand National Board, Royal Australian College of Surgeons.
Hernia causation

For cover the **hernia must be caused by an accident** and not ‘wholly or substantially’ by disease or ageing and not merely bringing to light a pre-existent condition

Objective evidence
- The fundamental mechanism of hernia formation is collagen disease and/or loss of structural integrity at the musculotendinous abdominal layers
- Critical review of recent literature, case control studies and prospective studies
- Increasing incidence with age, male predominance
- No association with work type or physical activities.
Hernia causation

No evidence that a single or recurrent strenuous event can cause an abdominal wall hernia which would not have occurred anyway*


A common set of factors that were often evoked as causative in the genesis of a hernia were cough, obesity, constipation, benign prostatic hypotrophy, pregnancy, ascites, and heavy lifting. It is safe to say today… that these factors revealed a hernia but did not cause it.*

ACC cover for abdominal wall hernias

ACC cover is likely for:
Traumatic abdominal wall hernia e.g. direct blow from handlebar or lap seatbelt injuries

ACC cover is very unlikely for:
• Femoral
• Epigastric
• Umbilical or para-umbilical
• Spigelian

Cover decided on a case-by-case basis for:
• Inguinal hernia
Inguinal hernia caused by a single strenuous lift means the sudden loss of structural integrity of musculotendinous abdominal layers while lifting a heavy object.

Factors that **must** be present:

- The patient reports that a single strenuous event has caused the hernia
- The event involves the application of an unusual, sudden, unexpected force as opposed to a controlled movement
- The patient suffered a significant groin pain at the time of the event, and the pain was substantial enough to cause the patient to **cease** activity at that time or soon afterwards.
Cover for inguinal hernia

In addition, the following factors **would be expected**:

- A medical or nurse practitioner’s records of the physical examination includes localised groin tenderness and a demonstrable lump in the groin.
- The hernia diagnosis is made within 10 days of the event. If not made within 10 days there must be a reasonable explanation for that delay.
- There is no prior or current history of a non-traumatic inguinal hernia on the same side.
- If the event occurred in a workplace, an incident has been officially reported.

Note: 1. Imaging is not necessary. A clinical diagnosis of an inguinal hernia by a doctor or nurse practitioner is sufficient.

2. No distinction between direct or indirect hernias.
Case study 1

45 year old male truck driver
No prior history of hernia
Was climbing into his truck and ‘felt a pop’ in the groin
This is something I do everyday and I need to twist as I get in the cab
Did not need to stop work and did not take time off
Lump in left groin noted the next day
Saw GP the following week when a 4cm left sided inguinal hernia noted, with mild tenderness
Work report completed the day after GP visit.

• Patient reports a single strenuous event has caused the hernia  Y / N
• Unusual, sudden, unexpected force (vs controlled movement)  Y / N
• Groin pain at the time, substantial enough to cease activity  Y / N
Case study 2

53 year old male road construction worker
Intermittently using (and leaning on) a concrete drill at work over 3 weeks
Thursday afternoon noted a tender lump next to his belly button
Seen at A&M clinic that night, where a tender para-umbilical hernia was identified
Referred for surgical opinion
Surgeon reports hernia appeared after prolonged use of machine, and this hernia appeared through a weakened part of the abdominal wall

ACC medical adviser notes umbilical hernias are common after age 50, and current medical opinion is the events described can reveal the hernia which is emerging, but the activity itself is not the cause of the umbilical hernia.
References


Acknowledgements

The Expert Advisory Group

Grant Coulter, General Surgeon
Sally Langley, Plastic and Reconstructive Surgeon
Julian Speight, General Surgeon
Spencer Beasley, Paediatric Surgeon

ACC
Peter Jansen, Clinical Lead Treatment Injury
Mike Sexton, General Surgeon
Lorraine Welch, Obstetrician and Gynaecologist
Mary Ahern, Senior Solicitor
Meagan Stephenson, Evidence-based Healthcare Researcher
Tanya Skaler, Programme Manager